THE DANGERS
OF INTERPRETATION
ORIGINS OF MODERNISM
Todd K. Bender, Series Editor

Conrad's Lingard Trilogy
Empire, Race, and Women in the Malay Novels
by Heliéna Krenn, SSps

Virginia Woolf and Mrs. Brown
Toward a Realism of Uncertainty
by Herta Newman

Gerard Manley Hopkins and His Contemporaries
Liddon, Newman, Darwin, and Pater
by Jude V. Nixon

Saving Beauty
Further Studies in Hopkins
edited by Michael E. Allsopp and David Anthony Downes

Keeping the Victorian House
A Collection of Essays
edited by Vanessa D. Dickerson

Rituals of Dis-integration
Romance and Madness in the Victorian Psychomythic Tale
by Edwin F. Block, Jr.

The Dangers of Interpretation
Art and Artists in Henry James and Thomas Mann
by Ilona Treitel
THE DANGERS OF INTERPRETATION
Art and Artists in Henry James and Thomas Mann

Ilona Treitel
The dangers of interpretation: art and artists in Henry James and Thomas Mann / by Ilona Treitel.

Includes bibliographical references (p.) and index.

ISBN 0-8153-2181-3


Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Treitel, Ilona.

The dangers of interpretation: art and artists in Henry James and Thomas Mann / by Ilona Treitel.

p. cm. — (Garland reference library of the humanities; vol. 1959. Origins of modernism; vol. 8)

Includes bibliographical references (p.) and index.

ISBN 0-8153-2181-3


813'.4—dc20 95-26430

CIP

In memory of Marie and Alexander Grünfeld
The Modernist Movement, characterized by the works of T.S. Eliot, James Joyce, Virginia Woolf, William Faulkner, and writers of similar stature, dominated Anglo-American literature for some fifty years following World War I. By the time the United States emerged from its military involvement in Indo-China in the 1970s, the Modernist Movement had disintegrated into Post-Modernism. High Modernism's most proud claim was that it would "make it new," that it represented a radical and sudden break with previous cultural traditions. We now see this claim to be false. Nowhere is Modernism more derivative than in its claim to radical novelty. The Modernist "revolution" of the twentieth century is best seen as the culmination of ideology developing in the late nineteenth century. This series of books is devoted to the study of the origins of Modernism in the half-century between the Franco-Prussian War and the First World War, from the death of Dickens to the roaring twenties and the Lost Generation.

As drama is the center of the literature of the Elizabethan Age, so criticism is the focus of the Modernist Age. Modernist writers worked in an environment of university and school curricula more introspective, self-conscious, and cannibalistic than ever before. How did the philosophical and pedagogical system supporting Modernism develop? What part does feminism play in the struggle for literary domination? How do changing systems of patronage and the economy of literature influence Modernism as a vastly expanded reading public is eventually augmented by cinema, radio, and television as consumers of literature? Do the roots of cultural pluralism within English literature recede back to the Victorian era? When English is used as the vehicle for expression of American, Canadian, Australian, or Indian culture; or for Afro-American, Hispano-American, Asian-American, or Amero-Indian culture, where do the origins of this eclectic pluralism lie?

We believe that there are two important groups of writers essential to the development of Modernism: (1) Gerard Manley Hopkins and the circle of his correspondents (Robert Bridges, Coventry Patmore, Canon Richard Watson Dixon, and
related figures) and (2) the circle of writers surrounding Joseph Conrad (Ford Madox Ford, Henry James, Stephen Crane, and others). We especially encourage the further study of these two groups as foundation stones for the Modernist Movement, but there are many other sources important to its development.

Todd K. Bender
University of Wisconsin
# CONTENTS

Acknowledgements | ix  
Abbreviations     | xi  
Introduction      | 3  

1 The Making of an Artist by Himself and Others  
   *Roderick Hudson*, "Little Herr Friedemann,"  
   "The Dilettante," "Little Lizzy," *Tonio Kröger* | 13  

2 "The Crisis of Representativeness"  
   *The Tragic Muse, Royal Highness* | 43  

3 The Artist as Impostor  
   *Felix Krull*, "The Aspern Papers,"  
   *The Sacred Fount* | 73  

4 Two Beasts in the Jungle  
   *The Beast in the Jungle, Death in Venice* | 115  

5 Art, Disease and Decay  
   *Buddenbrooks, The Wings of the Dove* | 149  

6 Damnation or Salvation?  
   *The Golden Bowl, Doctor Faustus* | 187  

Notes | 241  

Bibliography | 293  

Index | 309
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This study derives from a Ph.D. dissertation submitted to Bar-Ilan University, Israel, and prepared under the supervision of Professor Harold Fisch and Dr. Rachel Salmon. Indeed, Professor Fisch and Dr. Salmon have followed this project from the very beginning, and I wish to acknowledge very gratefully the help I have received from both. Their criticism has always been pertinent and stimulating and their patience unlimited. I find it particularly difficult to express adequately my gratitude to Professor Fisch for his encouragement, his valuable suggestions, and the time he has so generously devoted to helping me transform the dissertation into the present book. My thanks also go to Professor Murray Roston for his advice and for his assistance when the going was tough. I owe a special debt of gratitude to Dr. Sharon Baris for sharing with me her insight and infecting me with her enthusiasm. My sister, Vivianne Barsky, has offered plenty of encouragement and provided useful suggestions, and she too deserves my gratitude.

I should also like to thank my children Michael, Sharon and Vera, who not only helped in various practical matters, but were lively partners in discussions of many of the issues raised in the study. My greatest thanks go to my husband Paul for his support, his interest, and his constant encouragement.
# ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>James</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&quot;AP&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;The Aspern Papers&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bijn</td>
<td>The Beast in the Jungle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GB</td>
<td>The Golden Bowl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RH</td>
<td>Roderick Hudson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SF</td>
<td>The Sacred Fount</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TM</td>
<td>The Tragic Muse</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WD</td>
<td>The Wings of the Dove</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mann</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DiV</td>
<td>Death in Venice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KH</td>
<td>Royal Highness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;LHF&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;Little Herr Friedemann&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;LL&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;Little Lizzy&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TK</td>
<td>Tonio Kröger</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Unless otherwise indicated, translations from primary and secondary sources are my own.
THE DANGERS OF INTERPRETATION
Introduction

Henry James and Thomas Mann achieved a similar status not only in their separate canons but in their common Western literary tradition. While sharing a cultural heritage, both also contributed to its transformation in fictions representing the transition from nineteenth-century art to modernism.

Nevertheless, as far as I have been able to determine, there has, as yet, been virtually no extended critical examination of affinities between James and Mann. This is, perhaps, partially explained by a nearly total lack of reference to each other in the biographical material relating to the two authors. Although Henry James read German well, and, moreover, some of Mann's early works were known in England during James's lifetime, I have found no references to Mann either in biographical works about James or in James's own autobiographical and critical writings; nor do his Notebooks or published letters contain such references. In Thomas Mann's case the situation is slightly different. Before World War I, James was not well known in Germany: comparatively few of his works were translated, and Mann does not seem to have read any of these translations. It is also highly unlikely that the young Mann read James in English; in an essay of 1925, he mentions his difficulties in reading that language, and his consequent lack of familiarity with English literature. However, after his emigration to America, Thomas Mann began reading James in English. In fact, from 1942 on, we find diary entries in which he mentions specific works by the American author, whom he appears to admire. He is particularly satisfied at being mentioned together with James as one of the greatest modern novelists. Nevertheless, he does not reveal real familiarity with James's work.

While similarities between Henry James and Thomas Mann, then, have not been investigated, there are a number of separate studies of James and Mann which address the issue of each writer's explicit preoccupation with the canonical authors who preceded him. This related concern, in addition to the shared cultural heritage and
the comparable status the two writers occupied in their literary traditions, as well as similarities in the thematization of the problem of interpretation, suggest the usefulness of a comparative study. Moreover, the fact that both authors have been discussed in the context of Nietzsche's thought points to pertinent links in their views of creative and interpretative activities.

It is, in fact, on Henry James's and Thomas Mann's investigation of creativity that my study focuses, as I examine works in which the two novelists thematize the creative process as an interpretive one. Indeed, the similarities between James and Mann are particularly conspicuous in the fictions that self-reflexively treat the author's and the reader's interpretive quest for meaning. The semblances are also prominent in the narrative techniques used by both writers, technical devices, which make the reader conscious that he, the reader, is actually creating his own meaning.

In this study I adopt Harold Bloom's theory that a literary text constitutes a creative misreading of an earlier author's text. I shall consider the literary text a field upon which author and reader meet, the reader playing an active part interpreting what the author has recorded. Since, in Bloom's terms, the reader's interpretive activity is not intrinsically different from the author's, it too can be thought of as constituting a creative misreading. Consequently, the reader's interpretation of a work of literature results in a new work, "antithetical" to a previous text, which he necessarily misinterprets as he makes it his own. The reader's creativity therefore threatens the author, just as the author challenged his precursor and appropriated his text when "revising" it. But the reader is as vulnerable as the author whose authority he jeopardizes for, as "interpretation" is implicitly hierarchical and cannot proceed without a usurpation of authority, his re-created text is necessarily revised again and, consequently, appropriated by the next reader in the "hierarchy," or by his own next reading. "There is only interpretation," Bloom says, "and...every interpretation answers an earlier interpretation, and then must yield to another one."

If he does not "create" his own texts but only "interprets them into existence," the author (and, it follows, the reader as well) may very well suffer from an "anxiety of influence," fearing that his
precursors have left him nothing to do.\textsuperscript{12} Bloom allows for some exceptions, most notably Shakespeare, Milton and Goethe, who, he argues, "absorbed" their precursors.\textsuperscript{13} Among them Goethe, in particular, acknowledged influence but "denied the anxiety."\textsuperscript{14} Of special interest to my study is Bloom's claim—which I shall discuss more fully in the relevant chapters—that "Thomas Mann, a great sufferer from the anxiety of influence, and one of the great theorists of that anxiety, suffered more acutely for Goethe's not having suffered at all."\textsuperscript{15} However, the absence of anxiety in these authors does not necessarily imply the absence of a struggle with their precursors. On the contrary, Bloom's repeated claim that Shakespeare, Milton and Goethe absorbed their poetic forerunners indicates a confrontation in which the "stronger" author emerged victorious, both because of the weakness of his precursors,\textsuperscript{16} and as a consequence of what Goethe called the force of his will.\textsuperscript{17} A text is thus "a psychic battlefield upon which authentic forces struggle for the only victory worth winning, the divinating triumph over oblivion," and most often neither author nor reader can be certain of being "strong" enough to win that victory.\textsuperscript{18}

More than the "anxiety of influence" threatens interpreting author and reader, according to Bloom. Both risk danger when they attempt "to decide meaning or perhaps to see whether meaning can be decided,"\textsuperscript{19} and, even worse, when they mistakenly believe that they have found the one privileged meaning that, Bloom argues, interpretation cannot reveal. Within the hierarchical interpretive chain, no text has an "ascertainable meaning," for texts are made up of words which, in turn, refer only to other words. Since he assumes that language revises previous language, he implies that interpretation is a "creative misreading," which cannot create an autonomous meaning that escapes the hierarchical chain.\textsuperscript{20} Nevertheless, Bloom's use of the term mis-interpretation suggests that he does not deny the existence of true meaning; rather, he claims that human beings cannot attain it through language. According to Bloom, true meaning resides in God, and, consequently, it is inaccessible to fallen man. Relying on the 18th century Italian philosopher Vico, Bloom claims that, "the world of the indefinite, the world of ambivalent and uncertain images, which is the world of poetry, becomes identical with our fallen
state... [We] suffer a condition in which we are ignorant of causation and origins, yet still we are very much in quest of origins." However, while Bloom argues that language, the only medium by which we can pursue meaning, must fail us, he opposes the deconstructionist claim that "language... [does] our writing for us," because it denies even the will to pursue meaning. Acknowledging the impossibility--after Nietzsche's claim that "rational thought is only interpretation," and after Freud's theories of the unconscious—to "return wholly to a mode of interpretation that seeks to restore meaning to texts," he would, nonetheless, "favour a kind of interpretation that seeks to restore and redress meaning, rather than primarily to deconstruct meaning." After all, despite Nietzsche's "perspectivism" and Freud's "reductiveness," we are reminded, Bloom claims, by poems and dreams of what "consciously we have never known." It is this forgotten consciousness that Bloom claims the great poets of the 19th century, interpreted.

The desire to pursue "causation" and "origins" has called forth, according to Bloom, the need for a myth about the first poets--whom all subsequent poets fear to imitate, yet strive to re-create. In Bloom's myth--a "mis-reading" of Auerbach's interpretation of Vico--these original poets were primitive solitary nomads, who tried to impose imaginative order on the chaos of nature with their imagination in order to survive. Their "wisdom" was ceremonial rather than rational, and the ceremonies they invented were equivalent to poetry. These original "poets" believed they could foretell--"divine"--the future, and thus survive chaos by interpreting the past they perceived in magic signs. The first poems, then, were the "divinations" of these magicians. However, in addition to "foretell," "divine" also means "to become a god by foretelling." Consequently, the first poets, as Bloom conceives of them, sought to usurp God's power in their attempts to create a future that would make them immortal. Bloom's myth thus enables him to claim that "meaning gets started by catastrophe that is also a ruining and breaking creation," or, in other words, by "usurpation" and "violence." Such usurpation and violence have been explored by Freud as endemic in the family group and have led Bloom to speculate that
"meaning gets started...by catastrophes at our origins [and] by family passion and strife." In fact, the theories outlined above, especially that of the anxiety of influence with its emphasis on the poet's simultaneous admiration and fear of his precursor, are, to a great extent, based on Bloom's "mis-reading" of Freud's "family romance." Just as Freud speaks of a child's early identification with the father, which progressively changes into antagonism, Bloom claims that a poet's "initial love for the precursor's poetry is transformed rapidly enough into revisionary strife." Although the poet (in Bloom's extended sense of author-reader) strives to emulate his precursor-father, he must also impute "error" to the father-figure in order to usurp his role as creator and thus perceive himself as "self-begotten." In Freud's "family romance," the little boy's hostility turns into "a wish to get rid of his father in order to take his place with his mother." In Bloom's reading of Freud, the mother-figure becomes the poet's creative impulse, his "Muse," and the struggle with the father-precursor originates in his need to have been inspired first, that is, to have impregnated the mother-muse, and thus to have become the father of himself. Since this need cannot be fulfilled, Bloom says that the poet comes to feel betrayed by the mother-muse and rejects her as a harlot who "has whored with many before him."

In his paper on narcissism, Freud speaks of a "primary narcissism" which manifests itself in all infants as a simultaneous love for the nurturing mother (or her substitute) and for the self. The narcissist will later choose his sexual objects according to one of these primary models. He will attach himself either to a mother figure who cares for him, or he will choose his own self as his love object, not only loving himself, or his ideal of himself, but overestimating the power of his wishes, believing in the magic force of his words and refusing to accept his own mortality. One cause for the development of this love for the self is the boy's surrender of the "sexual overvaluation of the mother" (or the girl's of the father), which are "incompatible with reality" and with the child's own sexual development. That surrender is experienced by the boy as the mother's rejection of him, and is thus extremely painful. In fact, Freud claims, his "loss" of the mother's love leaves a permanent "narcissistic scar." In Bloom's "mis-reading" of Freud, the scar
causes the anxiety in which the poet's creative drive originates; the poet strives to master the anxiety with his narcissistic "pride of an originator" and his equally narcissistic belief in the "omnipotence of thought," that is, in the power of the mind over life and death.40

Deliberately misinterpreting Freud, Bloom repeatedly links narcissism and artistic creativity. For instance, reading narcissism as the illness Freud is referring to, he argues that the lines from Heine that Freud interprets as claiming that we love in order not to be ill, actually "state a psychogenesis of creativity rather than of love":

Krankheit ist wohl der letzte Grund
Des ganzen Schöpferdrangs gewesen;
Erschaffend konnte ich genesen
Erschaffend wurde ich gesund.

(Illness was no doubt the final cause of the whole urge to create. By creating, I could recover; by creating, I became healthy.)41

Such linkage, which depends on Nietzsche even more than on Freud, has provided much of the basis for recent Thomas Mann criticism, following a study of Felix Krull by Hans Wysling, who like Bloom relies on Freud and Nietzsche. Indeed, Nietzsche's influence on Thomas Mann has not only been extensively demonstrated by critics, but frequently commented on by Mann himself. As for Henry James, it has been argued that he, too, was familiar with and, perhaps, also affected by the German philosopher. Nietzsche's association between disease and creativity is, however, problematic, since his statements on the relationship between illness and art are contradictory. Disease must be cured, and it is the creative process, he maintains, that provides the cure. Yet he also stipulates disease as a precondition for the creative act: the creative artist must be ill in order to be creative. Nonetheless, Nietzsche considers illness the artist's bane, and condemns as a decadent weakling the artist who—in his judgement—has yielded to it. Such an artist degenerates into a clown, who either manufactures empty and thus decadent form, or, in contrast, surrenders to formlessness—the very antithesis to art.42
Nevertheless, in his study, Wysling maintains that the narcissist's cure occurs if he succeeds in transforming his idealization of the self into a work of art. Thus the diseased artist, in particular the narcissist, is "saved by language," if he can transfer his desire for beauty and power from his body image to his written text. In contrast, Manfred Dierks and Rolf Günter Renner claim that it is only through Lacan's reinterpretation, in "Le Stade du Miroir," of Freud's *On Narcissism*, that narcissism can be theoretically linked to language. The child's recognition, in the mirror reflection, of its own whole body, which he previously experienced as disconnected fragments, introduces the preverbal imaginary state, in which the reflection becomes both the self and "the other," and which leads to the child's entrance into the "symbolic," that is, language. Lacan's account of the mirror stage suggests the possibility that the three stages of development occur synchronically, as well as diachronically. This tension between synchronic and diachronic development enables Dierks to establish clearly the link between the narcissistic mirror-I, imagined wholeness, and language and claim that at the mirror stage the child experiences the symbolic, which it will later re-experience as the structure of language. Lacan calls "the mirror stage...a drama...which manufactures for the subject, caught up in the lure of spatial identification, the succession of phantasies that extends from a fragmented body image to a form of its totality." The memory of this fragmentation, which, according to Renner, the narcissist cannot overcome, is, in a sense, analogous to Freud's "narcissistic scar," and like Freud's "scar," it can motivate creativity: in the narcissist who has failed to re-construct a realistic "self-image," the desire for the wholeness he perceived at the mirror stage becomes transformed into a creative force. A narcissistic writer imposes "totality" on his work by structuring a mythical "self" in language, and masters reality by creating it in language.

Though it is not my intention to base my study extensively on Lacan's theories, I propose to follow his arguments as far as they are relevant to my interpretation of Bloom. Lacan argues both that language exists before the "I" "enters" it in the "mirror stage," and that it has a life of its own, unrelated to the world of objects, so that, while structuring the unconscious, it does not convey meaning.
claim that "no signification can be sustained other than by reference to another signification" is, indeed, almost synonymous to Bloom's argument that "every interpretation answers only an earlier interpretation"--both drawing on Nietzsche's belief that language continually creates its own changing truth. Following Nietzsche, Lacan as well as Bloom can thus be read as considering language an inadequate medium for the transmission of the true meaning that the individual, nevertheless, seeks. If the interpretive task of the author and/or the reader is to find the absolute, privileged meaning of a verbal message through a verbal message, it is bound to fail. However, given the interpreter's narcissistically motivated creative drive, the task he assumes is, rather, to impose on a verbal text his meaning, as the privileged meaning. In Bloom's chain of misreadings, that meaning must be antithetical to the one imposed by the predecessor in the interpretive hierarchy. It must also, inevitably, be subversively re-created by the successor in the hierarchy.

However, the meaning that the interpreter imposes on a text need not be seen only as a consequence of the interpretive power struggle. In its apparent condemnation of interpretive force, the perception of Mikhail Bakhtin, for instance, seems diametrically opposed to Bloom's. Bakhtin claims that "a unitary language is not something given [dan], but is always in essence posited [zadan]--and at every moment of its linguistic life it is opposed to the realities of heteroglossia. "Heteroglossia"--the "stratification" of language into endlessly varying and constantly developing different discourses"--allows for an ongoing dialogue between meanings, each of which is "true," while, the dialogic activity itself is also "true." This dialogic activity stems, Bakhtin claims, from the fact that "no living word relates to its object in a singular way," because the same object always has been and always will be interpreted in different words. Bakhtin's notion that "every speech act spring[s] from previous utterances and [is] structured in expectation of a future response," is reminiscent of Bloom's and Lacan's theories concerning interpretation and signification, especially as Bakhtin, too, insisting on a plurality of interacting meanings, denies the possibility of one privileged meaning. Nevertheless, Bakhtin grants that "unitary language" imposes limitations on "heteroglossia," thus "guaranteeing a certain
maximum of mutual understanding."\(^5\) In Bakhtin's theory there is, therefore, an unresolved tension between the unrestricted proliferation of meanings implicit in "heteroglossia" and the "unitary" force that limits such proliferation. Whether that force is intrinsic to language or is imposed by the "writer...who knows how to work language while remaining outside it," is not quite clear.\(^5\) However, from his *Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics*, it is possible to infer that, in Bakhtin's view, the author does have interpretive power, which is not usurped by the characters he has created; the author, he says, "in no way assumes a passivity"; rather he creates a text that reflects the "special interrelationship between [his] and the other's truth."\(^5\) While Bakhtin's theory, in a sense, seems more attractive than Bloom's because it does not focus on a struggle for interpretive mastery, it does, nevertheless require a "creative mind" who not only creates the multivalent text in which the dialogic interrelationship is acted out, but who actively, like Bloom's author, both controls its meanings and transmits them through a medium that is incapable of conveying the one privileged meaning the reader pursues.

Whereas for Lacan, there is a gap between the word and the object, Bakhtin sees the word *surrounded* by "heteroglot voices," one of which is that of the author.\(^5\) In my discussion of works by Henry James and Thomas Mann, Lacan's theories will be applicable primarily to texts which suggest an absence of meaning, a gap that the artist character, as well as the reader, attempts to fill. Other texts, seem to offer a multiplicity of meanings, and for my reading of them Bakhtin is relevant. However, it is principally Bloom's theories, as outlined above, that allow me to explore and discuss the "dangers" of interpretation that I find in works by James and Mann.

While most of the artists in the works by Henry James and Thomas Mann that I examine can be perceived as latecomers, it is, chiefly, the early works of both authors that focus on the particular "dangers" facing the latecomer artist. Aspiring to create a tradition of his own, he rejects the influences of the existing one. He is, nevertheless, constrained and thus threatened by those very influences, which he has difficulties in interpreting, partly because of the shifting meanings of language. In later works, these shifting meanings also cause the "crisis of representativeness" that afflicts
Introduction

those artists who perceive the gap between reality and representation (reflecting the gap between meaning and language) as constituting an absence. In their attempts to become creators by filling that absence, some of them practice deception, so that not only the status of the work of art, but also the moral stature of the artist, is set in doubt. The same kind of doubt surrounds the artist who transforms the "absence" into an image with constantly changing significances. Other fictions by James and Mann probe the metaphoric association between disease and creativity, in which illness is seen as the prerequisite for the creative act, and thus for the imposition of form implicit in the creation of art. Disease is, however, also represented as the drive to surrender the will to interpret and, rather, succumb to aestheticism. The moral stigma that appears to be attached to art is interpreted as stemming from the destructiveness inherent in the two conflicting drives, the drive to create form and the drive to surrender to formlessness, both motivated by disease. The artist's moral position is further jeopardized if he completely relinquishes his interpretive mastery and thus yields either to a nothingness that also threatens life or invites interpretive anarchy. Such anarchy makes possible the application of a ruthless force that not only destroys moral perception, but threatens to wipe out life and the creativity that stems from life.

It is, then, with these dangers, which are inherent in the creative process itself, and which threaten the artist and the reader as creators and as moral beings, that this comparative study of works by Henry James and Thomas Mann is concerned.
Notes to Introduction

1. Tristan, a volume of short works, among them Tonio Kröger and "Little Lizzy," was (rather unfavourably) reviewed in The Times Literary Supplement, 6 June 1903. See Hans Rudolf Vaget, Thomas Mann: Kommentar zu sämtlichen Erzählungen (Munich: Winkler, 1984) 73, 77-78. Royal Highness was translated into English in 1909. I have found no evidence of an English translation of Buddenbrooks, or of other works by Mann, before 1924.

2. Among them, A Passionate Pilgrim and Other Tales in 1875, Roderick Hudson in 1876, and The American in 1877.


4. Mann records reading about James's "ambiguity" (he uses the English term in the entry written in German) in October 1942, and in May 1943, just before he begins to write Doctor Faustus, he refers to James's "brilliant essay about Dickens, written at the age of 22 in 1864." See Thomas Mann, Tagebücher 1940-1943, ed. Peter de Mendelssohn (Frankfurt: Fischer, 1982) 481, 580. In September 1945, Mann reads "H. James's 'Short Stories of Writers and Artists,'" and in January 1946, The Turn of the Screw. In an entry in October 1945, Mann refers to a "prospectus" introducing Clifton Fadiman's The Short Stories of Henry James, in which James is mentioned, "fourth, after Proust, Joyce and Mann," as one of the greatest novelists of the age. "Fantastic," is Mann's comment. (The "prospectus" apparently quotes from Fadiman's Introduction: "James...is a modern writer, to be ranked with Joyce, Proust, Mann...") See Thomas Mann, Tagebücher 1944-1946, ed. Inge Jens (Frankfurt: Fischer, 1986) 251, 304, 270, and Clifton Fadiman, Introduction, The Short Stories of Henry James (New York: Random House, 1945) xv.


6. Bloom, The Anxiety of Influence 94. Though Bloom mostly speaks of "poets," he makes it clear that he does not only mean "verse-writer." Moreover, he stresses that by "reading" he "mean[s]

11. Bloom, Agon 244.
15. Bloom adds: "Questioning for some sign of such anxiety in Goethe, [Mann] came up with a single question from the Westöstlicher Diwan: 'Does a man live where others also live?" and had one of his own characters put it to Adrian Leverkühn in Doctor Faustus. See The Anxiety of Influence 52-53.
22. Bloom, Agon 43.
25. Bloom, The Anxiety of Influence 60-64.
27. Bloom, Agon 43.
28. Bloom, Agon 44.
29. Bloom, The Anxiety of Influence 64. If Bloom's theory is applied, my account is, of necessity, a "misreading" of Bloom.
30. Or, "it would be safer to say, 'with the parents': for before a child has arrived at definite knowledge of the difference between the sexes...it does not distinguish in value between its father and its mother." The subject, Freud says, is complicated because of "the triangular character of the Oedipus situation and the constitutional bisexuality of each individual." See Sigmund Freud, The Ego and the
Introduction, Notes


33. Bloom, A Map of Misreading 243-44.
34. Freud, The Ego and the Id 371.
38. Freud, The Ego and the Id 371, and Beyond the Pleasure Principle 291.
41. Trans. in On Narcissism 79. See Agon 104-05.
46. Dierks, "Über einige Beziehungen" 286.
trans. Alan Sheridan, in *Critical Theory Since 1965* 736; second emphasis added.


Notes to Chapter 1


2. Rowe, *The Theoretical Dimensions* 32.

3. Rowe, *The Theoretical Dimensions* 46, 47.


7. Teahan 160.

8. Rowe actually establishes a link between James and Mann with his claim that James engages in a power struggle against his precursors that "anticipates the presumption of...Mann, Proust, Joyce, Pound and Faulkner." *The Theoretical Dimensions* 154.


11. For a survey of judgements in this matter by American critics, see Rowe, *The Theoretical Dimensions* 36-47. Rowe notes, for instance that both T.S. Eliot and Ezra Pound commend James for criticizing the deficiencies of the American tradition (37-38).


16. See e.g. Dierks, "Beziehungen" 286.


20. Rowe, *The Theoretical Dimensions* 49. Leland Person sees Balzac, too, as a "father figure" and claims that escaping "one precursory paternal influence," James substituted "one father for another." But as Balzac is also the "father" of Hawthorne, James again takes the father's place. Leland Person, Jr., "The Aboriginal Hawthorne: Mastering the Master from Beyond the Grave," *The Henry James Review* 12 (1991): 166.


22. Dierks, "Beziehungen" 283.


24. While he does not link it to narcissism, Leon Edel discusses a paternal-filial as well as a fraternal double relationship between Rowland and Roderick. See *The Life of Henry James I* (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1977) 411-12.

Chapter 7, Notes 247

Kohut's and Kernberg's works on narcissism to her reading of English romantic poets.

27. See Freud, *On Narcissism* 84.
28. Pointing out that Mann's early stories are autobiographical and, consequently, portray artists, Hans Rudolf Vaget stresses that Tonio Kröger differs from his more decadent "brothers," principally in his "tenacious ambition and persistent industry," thus prefiguring, among others, Gustave Aschenbach. See Thomas Mann *Kommentar* 67-68; 114-15.
34. Whereas Mann called the story "Der Bajazzo," Lowe-Porter's translation of the title as "The Dilettante," is supported by most critics who read the text as an analysis of dilettantism and degeneration, influenced by Paul Bourget, among others. See Vaget, *Kommentar* 68. In this instance I have amended Lowe-Porter's rendering of "Bajazzo-begabung" ("gifts...of the dilettante variety," "Dilettante" 40).
35. See Wysling, *Narzissmus* 29. Wysling points out that Mann treats the connection between, business, swindle, and art in
Buddenbrooks, Tonio Kröger, and, obviously, in Felix Krull. I shall return to this question below.


37. Laage 25.


39. Renner 22.

40. Renner 45.

41. The German "Schuld" used in the sentence means both "guilt" and "fault."

42. Reinhard Baumgart points out that in some, the women are portrayed as predominantly erotic objects, who arouse fear, estrangement, and scorn, as well as devotion. See Selbstvergessenheit: Drei Wege zum Werk: Thomas Mann, Franz Kafka, Berthold Brecht (Munich: Carl Hanser, 1989) 48. Listing in detail the great number of stereotypical roles assigned to the early Mann's female characters--about whose consciousnesses we learn nothing--Karl Werner Böhm emphasizes the destructiveness to men that is inherent in all the roles. See Zwischen Selbstzucht und Verlangen: Thomas Mann und das Stigma Homosexualität: Untersuchungen zu Frühwerk und Jugend, Studien zur Literatur- und Kulturgeschichte 2 (Würzburg: Königshausen & Neumann, 1991) 171-76.

43. Renner 45-46.

44. The German "Schoss" signifies both "lap" and "womb."

45. See e.g. Renner 44; Kurzke 57. For a discussion whether "The Dilettante" reflects Thomas Mann, as his "mask" or his "confession," see Peter de Mendelssohn, Nachbemerkungen zu Thomas Mann 2: Frühe Erzählungen, Späte Erzählungen, Leiden und Grösse der Meister (Frankfurt: Fischer, 1982) 19-20.

46. In some of Mann's early stories, the pathological aspect of narcissism is more marked than in Roderick Hudson, in particular in those where it is repulsively thematized ("Little Herr Friedemann" and "Little Lizzy"). To a certain extent, Hermann Kurzke's description of narcissism fits the protagonists:

Narcissus loves only what is his; he continues to love his mother and the child's intimate dreamworld. He hates his father...and under
pressure he regresses to his mother's womb. Narcissus does not love the strange woman from the hostile world. In this respect, narcissism is a developmental disturbance, a stagnation, an insistence on remaining a child and a dreamer, on loving one's mother and sister, and a refusal to become a man.


48. Among the essays and reviews that James wrote before Roderick Hudson are critical articles on Goethe, Turgenev, Dumas, Balzac and Flaubert. See e.g. Henry James Letters I, Leon Edel, ed. (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard Univ. Press, 1974), and Henry James, The Critical Muse.

49. In "On Myself" Mann refers to his relationship with Goethe as a mystical union with the father (see Dierks, Studien 161). As for his indentification of Turgenev with the father, see Reed, Thomas Mann 321, and Laage.

50. See e.g. Reed, Thomas Mann 32-33.


52. Edel, Life I, 404.

53. See Oscar Cargill, The Novels of Henry James (1961; rpt. New York: Hafner, 1971) 35. For instance, in Spring Torrents, Maria Nikolaevna's incongruous marriage is accounted for by her claim: "I married Polozov [because] with him I am free, completely free, as free as the air, as the wind." See Ivan Turgenev, Spring Torrents, 1872; trans. Leonard Schapiro (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1980) 153. James has Mallet interpret Christina Light as motivated by a passion for freedom not unlike Maria's. In fact, it is his sympathy with Christina's "energy...audacity [and] restless questioning soul" that prevents Mallet from wholeheartedly persuading her to marry the
Prince (RH 279). However, this compassion also blinds him to the implications of such a marriage: Christina will obtain a freedom, which, like Maria in her relations with Sanin, she will finally exercise on encountering Roderick in Switzerland.

54. There exists a wealth of critical material examining the relationship between Goethe and Mann—which I refer to again, below, in chapter 3. For a survey of Mann's own acknowledgement of that relationship in his essays and speeches, as well as of his re-interpretations of Goethe's works in his fictions, see e.g. the chapter "Die Imitatio Goethe's" in Wysling, Narzissmus 213-23. Bloom's remarks on Mann's "fear" of Goethe as it is reflected in Doctor Faustus and The Genesis of a Novel has already been commented upon in the Introduction. See Bloom, The Anxiety of Influence 53.

55. This, Kurzke claims, is one explanation for Mann's making Aschenbach in Death in Venice (first conceived of as Goethe in Marienbad--the story of the old Goethe's infatuation with young Ulrike von Levetzow) both an heir to the classic Goethe and a victim of the onslaught of Dionysian power (Kurzke 260).

56. See e.g. Mayer 34.
57. Edel, Life I, 217, 258.
58. See e.g. Henry James, Letters I, 58, 411.

60. In "The Story of a Year" (1865), there is a direct reference to Goethe's drama, whereas in The American (1877), Claire de Cintré's brother Valentin dies, defeated in a duel over a coquette--a re-creation of Valentine's death after the duel he fights with Faust. James also published a review of Faust in Nation in 1873. See Henry James, Letters I, 412.

61. William Veeder notes another "re-interpration": he observes that Christina's white poodle is reminiscent of a black poodle figuring in Cherbuliez' Roman d'une honnête femme, a melodrama from which, Veeder argues, James borrowed and transformed Christina. See William Veeder, Henry James--The Lessons of the Master: Popular Fiction and Personal Style in the Nineteenth Century (Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1975) 113-15.


63. Faust 145.
64. Faust 503.
65. See below, ch. 6.


70. Rowe, *The Theoretical Dimensions* 51.


72. I do not argue that "narrative differs from the plastic arts by its "'reading time,'" nor that "spatial forms are static, closed systems which can be completely apprehended in zero time." Rather, I accept W.J.T. Mitchell's claim that the relationship between time and space, as well as between narrative and plastic art, is "one of complex interaction, interdependence, and interpenetration." I maintain, however, that this interdependence does not invalidate the distinction between "temporal" and "spatial," and that the very complexity of the relationship causes the difficulties in the "temporal" linguistic interpretation of "spatial" plastic art. See W.J.T. Mitchell, "Spatial Form in Literature: Toward a General Theory," *Critical Inquiry* 6 (1980): 539-67. See also his *Iconology: Image, Text, Ideology* (Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1987), particularly the chapter "Image Versus Text: Figures of the Difference." The relationship between "spatial" art and "temporal" literature is extensively dealt with by Wendy Steiner, in *The Colours of Rhetoric: Problems in the Relation between Modern Literature and Painting* (Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1982). Examining Viola Hopkins's definition of "pictorialism:" "'the practice of describing people, places, scenes, or parts of scenes as if they were paintings or subjects for a painting, and the use of art objects for the thematic projection and overtone,'" particularly as it pertains to Henry James, Marianna Torgovnick acknowledges the problem of the individual reader's capacity to visualize a verbal text, as well as the interpreter's ability to verbalize a visual text. She quotes Foucault's observation: "'the relation of language to painting is an infinite relation. It is not that words are imperfect, or that, when confronted by the visible, they prove
insufferably inadequate. Neither can be reduced to the other's terms: it is in vain that we say what we see, what we see never resides in what we say.'" See Torgovnick, *The Visual Arts* 26-30. In his chapter "Phenomenological Hermeneutics: Henry James and Literary Impressionism" in *The Theoretical Dimensions of Henry James*, John Carlos Rowe examines the issue of verbal interpretations of visual impressions particularly as it is relevant in James's texts.


74. Ulrich Weinzierl, "Die 'besorgniserregende Frau': Anmerkungen zu Luischen, Thomas Manns 'peinlichster Novelle,'" *Thomas Mann Jahrbuch* (1991) 18. I have also played the chords indicated in the text on the piano but achieved no "gruesome" effect.


77. For the relationship between role-play and representation, see e.g. W.J.T. Mitchell, "Representation," in Frank Lentricchia and Thomas McLaughlin, eds., *Critical Terms for Literary Study* (Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1990) 11. I shall elaborate on the contiguity between "interpretation" and "representation," as well as on the relationship between role-play and political representation below, in ch. 2.

78. I discuss *The Tragic Muse* and *Felix Krull* below, in chs. 2 and 3, respectively.

79. For the German "Literat" which signifies both "man of letters," "literary man," and "writer" ("Schriftsteller") as distinct from poet ("Dichter"), I have retained H.T. Lowe-Porter's translation "literary man."


81. In fact, Tonio Kröger makes use of most Western artists, Hans Vaget claims: "The gamut reaches from Storm, Heine, Schiller, and Shakespeare to Goncharov, Nietzsche, Flaubert, Ibsen, Heinrich

82. Laage 18.

83. His love for Ingeborg replaces the love he felt "when he looked at Hans Hansen long ago, when he was still a little stupid boy." But "the flame of this love," in turn, "unobservably, without sensation or stir...went out after all" (TK 139, 145.)

84. Laage 15-25. As his title indicates ("Thomas Manns Verhältnis zu Theodor Storm und Iwan Turgenjew"), Laage is concerned with the influences of Turgenev and Storm.

85. Laage 16.

86. Koopmann, Konstanten 25. For other readings of Hamlet in Tonio Kröger, see e.g. Kurzke 98; Kurt Brätigam, Thomas Mann: Tonio Kröger (Munich: Oldenburg, 1969) 68, and Marcel Reich-Ranicki, Thomas Mann und die Seinen (Stuttgart: Deutsche Verlags-Anstalt, 1988) 95.

87. See Koopmann, Konstanten 26.

88. See e.g. Brätigam 68, and Kurzke 98.


91. The fact that Tonio Kröger repeats the narrator's words has elicited different comments. See Eggenschwiller 64-65.


Notes to Chapter 2


10. Weimann 441.


15. Weimann 441.

16. For a discussion of Miriam as art object and artist, see Graham, *The Drama of Fulfilment* 104-05.

17. Sternberg 806, 830.


19. See Sternberg 800.

20. Gordon and Stokes point out that this is Nick's "passionate declaration, not patient of any ambiguous reading." In it, "the verbal
art is still further reduced; words are not even names, and phrases, they compose an idiot's take of what is hollow, merely noise" ("The Tragic Muse" 100).


22. Here I adopt Rowe's definition of "text" as covering not only a work of literature" but denoting "a network of signs"--semantic, pictorial or pertaining to consciousness--"that requires certain boundaries [and] necessary forms" and is "the object of interpretation." See The Theoretical Dimensions of Henry James 194. See also Josue V. Harari, "Critical Factions/Critical Fictions," in Jouse V. Harari Textual Strategies: Perspectives in Post-Structural Criticism (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell Univ. Press, 1979) 39.


24. Graham, The Drama of Fulfilment 106; emphasis added.

25. Graham actually quotes the 1890 edition of The Tragic Muse in which Nick speaks of "copying" his "fellow mortals." The Drama of Fulfilment 101. In the New York Edition used for this study, "copying" has been exchanged for "reproducing," which suggests some interpretive activity on Nick's part but is still far from the re-creation I argue is inherent in interpretation.

26. See, e.g. Lynne Layton and Barbara Schapiro, "Theories of Self Formation and Self Pathology" 4-5.


31. The situation is obviously different in this age of audio-visual recording devices. However, recordings raise different interpretive problems which are beyond the scope of this study, and I shall not deal with them here.


33. Wysling, "Die Fragmente zu Thomas Mann's 'Fürsten-Novelle'" 66.

34. According to Wysling's reading of the unpublished notes and early fragments of Royal Highness, Klaus Heinrich was originally
very like Tonio Kroger. His "highness" was spiritual and excluded human intimacy. See "Die Fragmente zu Thomas Manns 'Fürsten-Novelle'" 95-96. Already in 1903, Mann himself mentions in a letter to Walter Opitz his projected "counterpart" to Tonio Kroger, to be called *Royal Highness*. And in his lecture "On Myself" (1940), he claims that Klaus Heinrich's formal existence is an allegory of the artist's life. See Thomas Mann, *Selbstkommentare: Königliche Hoheit und Bekenntisse des Hochstaplers Felix Krull*, eds., Hans Wysling and Marianne Eich-Fischer (Frankfurt: Fischer, 1989) 7, 48. Mann's remark that "loneliness is so difficult...to differentiate from public life," is applicable to Klaus Heinrich. See Thomas Mann, *Reflections of a Nonpolitical Man* 6. Among the critics, Helmut Koopmann claims that Klaus Heinrich displays the "stigmata" of the artist. See his "'Bekenntnisse des Hochstapler Felix Krull'" in *Thomas-Mann-Handbuch* 516. Hermann Kurzke points to the loneliness, alienation and constant play-acting forced on both the prince and the artist. See H. Kurzke, *Thomas Mann* 83. Hans Vaget, in contrast, finds that *Royal Highness* "celebrates" an "alliance" between king and artist, and thus elevates the artist. It is this view of the artist, he claims, that is repudiated in *Death in Venice*. See Hans Vaget, "'Der Tod in Venedig,'" in *Thomas-Mann-Handbuch* 590.


Royal Highness; see Hans Wysling Narzissmus 179-80. In a discussion of the influence of Scandinavian literature on Thomas Mann's works, Leonie Marx notes traces from additional Andersen tales in Royal Highness; see Leonie Marx, "Thomas Mann und die skandinavischen Literaturen," Thomas-Mann-Handbuch 193-95.

37. See Langenscheidts Grossworterbuch der englischen und deutschen Sprache (Berlin and Munich: Langenscheidt, 1989).

38. Mitchell, "Representation" 12.

39. T.J. Reed points out that Klaus Heinrich, like the artist, studies before these performances, just enough to be able to present a deceptive illusion of familiarity with real life. "Rather than a process of struggle and assimilation which will produce an 'honest' illusion [Mann] gives an account of how to create the illusion that such a process has been gone through." See Thomas Mann 108.


42. Goffman 10-11.

43. According to Helmut Koopmann, Klaus Heinrich is one of Thomas Mann's few latecomers strong enough to emancipate himself from his precursors. See Konstanten 29-31.

44. Heller, Der ironische Deutsche 100.

45. Heller speaks of a "happy end" with a taste of sadness, and Hans Mayer considers it an ironically broken utopia. See Heller, Der ironische Deutsche 101, and Mayer 79.

46. See above, 40-41. Here I differ from Wysling, who finds that Klaus Heinrich is unlike Tonio Kröger just because he is able to create such a synthesis. See Narzissmus 72.

47. Thomas Mann, Betrachtungen eines Unpolitischen 68.

Notes to Chapter 3

1. See Wysling, Narzissmus 25.

2. See Wysling, Quellenkritische Studien zum Werke Thomas Manns 182.

5. James, *The Art of the Novel* 32-34.
11. Wysling refers to these genres throughout his study.
13. For example, Wysling accounts for elements from the Bible (also beyond Mann's *Joseph-tetralogy*), the ancient Greeks, medieval works, the English, French, Russian and Scandinavian literatures.
14. On the influences on *Krull* of Schopenhauer's concept of Maya, and on Mann's own studies of Buddha, see, for example, Wysling *Narzissmus* 76, 112-16, 328.
15. See Wysling *Narzissmus* 64-66, 171-76, 292-300.
17. Wysling, *Narzissmus* 215. In chapter 1, I refer to Hermann Kurzke's account of the young Thomas Mann's movement away from the classicism of Goethe towards the romanticism of the "triumvirate."
18. Wysling, *Narzissmus* 64-65. The German term "Dichter" combines and exceeds the English "poet" and "author."
19. Wysling, *Narzissmus*, especially in the chapter "Die Imitatio Goethes" 213-223. In the final chapter Wysling writes: The constant *confrontation with the literary tradition* proves to be of vital importance for [Mann's] life and work. It makes possible an analytical process of disguise and disclosure that continually conceals and reveals the self in the 'other.' Thus Thomas Mann's technique of quotation and allusion (in his life as well as in his
work), indicates that his imagination is constantly engaged in a confrontation with traditional models: the great model must be attained and outdone (312).

21. See above, 56.
22. Wysling, *Narzissmus* 104-07. See also my discussion of Tonio Kröger above (36).
25. It is Krull's theft of her jewels and money, which she encourages, that enables him to open a bank account under that name (*Krull* 164).
28. Renner 399. Renner does not refer to Freud here, but his argument and the terms he uses appear to be influenced by Freud's *Beyond the Pleasure Principle*, *The Uncanny*, and *Totem and Taboo*.
31. Wysling accounts for this incongruity by referring to Schopenhauer's claim that multiplicity is the manifestation of one will and thus the multiplicity is illusionary. See *Narzissmus* 137.
32. In his study of *Felix Krull*, Wysling demonstrates in detail how elements from most of Mann's works are identifiable in *Krull*. The fact that Mann treated related themes in most of his works and continually re-interpreted these works is emphasized in many other studies. The aim of Renner's *Lebens-Werk*, for instance, is to investigate just this correlation between Mann's fictional works, essays, and autobiographical texts. See Renner 11.
35. See e.g. Vaget, "'Walsungenblut'" 576-78.
37. Like Läutner in "Little Lizzy," he executes an unexpected harmonic modulation, that the reader cannot hear: unlike the new key of the passage, the original key is not mentioned in the text, so that the reader has no way of knowing how surprising the "shift to C-sharp" is. See above, 34-35.
40. Renner 401.
44. Levy 66, 67.
47. Levy 69.
48. See Stein, "A Comedy of Masks" 175.
49. See also Graham, The Drama of Fulfilment 68.
50. Romeo and Juliet II. i. 81-85.
51. Rowe, The Theoretical Dimensions 126.
52. Hamlet III. iv. 23.
53. Person, "Eroticism and Creativity" 20, 21.
54. Millicent Bell reads this passage as reflecting Henry James's own repudiation--later reinforced in his Notes of a Son and Brother--of his early condemnation of Hawthorne, which was "drenched in an 'anxiety of influence.'" See Meaning in Henry James (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard Univ. Press, 1991) 188. I refer to James's Hawthorne above, 13-14.
55. All aspects of the narcissistic, romantic poet's perception of woman, according to Barbara Schapiro, The Romantic Mother: Narcissistic Patterns in Romantic Poetry ix, x, xi, xii. While not touching upon the narcissistic implications of the narrator's complex perceptions of woman, Hana Wirth-Nesher examines this complexity in detail in her article "Woman in the Plot: Henry James's Aspern Papers," HSLA 18 (1990): 79-94.
56. Stein, "A Comedy of Masks" 175.
58. Person, "Eroticism and Creativity" 20.
60. Stein, "A Comedy of Masks" 175.
61. See Wysling, Narzissmus. Wysling also claims that Freud barely accounts for that tension.
62. Levy 65, 69. See also Person, "Eroticism and Creativity," e.g. 21-22, 23, 26.
63. Levy 67.
64. For instance, in his "How Many Children Had Juliana Bordereau?" The Henry James Review 12 (1991): 120-28, Bernard Richards both accounts for different hypotheses presented by a number of critics and examines the question of Tina's parentage. His conclusion is that James's text does not supply the necessary proof that Tina indeed is Juliana's daughter. Rowe, in contrast, though noting that while "James has been careful, as usual, to provide sufficiently hard data to tempt such speculations and yet to place such
data in sufficiently subjective contexts to call into question nearly all of them," argues that the text nevertheless permits a reading of Tina as Juliana's daughter, and his own interpretation of "The Aspern Papers" is based on that assumption. See *The Theoretical Dimensions* 110, 111.

65. Person argues that one of the motives for the narrator's pursuit of the papers is to suppress what he sees as the tawdriness of Aspern's sexual relationship with Juliana. See "Eroticism and Creativity" 23.

66. See e.g. Rowe, *The Theoretical Dimensions* 111, and Person, "Eroticism and Creativity" 23, 25, 27.


70. Levy 74.


72. Such a reading is reinforced by Ellen Brown's analysis of the last words of the narrative ("I can scarcely bear my loss—I mean of the precious papers"). The fact that the narrator feels bound to "revise" the "unspecified loss" by adding the specification "of the precious papers" suggests, she claims, that the narrator himself cannot "articulate exactly what he means by 'loss.'" See "Revising Henry James: Reading the Spaces of *The Aspern Papers,*" *American Literature* 63 (1991): 269.


74. Susan Kappeler suggests that the narrator is "depleted" to the same degree that his "'crystal palace'" is growing in strength. See Susanne Kappeler, *Writing and Reading in Henry James* (New York: Columbia Univ. Press, 1980) 123.

75. A similar claim is made by Sergio Perosa in *Henry James and the Experimental Novel* 94.
76. This is one of the few commonly accepted critical tenets in the readings of *The Sacred Fount* that I have come across. See e.g. Perosa 78, or Krook: "it is the insoluble mystery in the heart of the creative process itself that...is dramatised in the curious fable of *The Sacred Fount."* (*The Ordeal of Consciousness*) 168.


78. See Krook, *The Ordeal of Consciousness* 187.

79. See e.g. Sicker, *Love and the Quest for Identity* 113, Krook 177, and Rimmon: "we have only to reread the description of Life to see how deadly it is...the image of the whitened face is taken from the realm of masks....On a literal level the man is not a bit more living than the mask--they are both inanimate objects in a picture on the wall" (*The Concept of Ambiguity* 224-25). See also John Carlos Rowe's interpretation of the painting in *Henry Adams and Henry James: The Emergence of a Modern Consciousness* (Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 1976) 169-71.

80. Rimmon 225.

81. Perosa 82-83.

82. E.g. "Mrs. Server confessed with every turn of her head to a part in a relation. It stuck out of her, her part in a relation; it hung before us, her part in a relation" (*SF* 84).

83. Whether Long is stupid or not is, of course, one of the questions that the text leaves open. If he remains--as he appears to do on at least one occasion--"a stolid coxcomb" (*SF* 24), the narrator's theory collapses. If, on the other hand, he never was stupid--and therefore fulfilled Newmarch's requirement of wit, the theory is also shred to pieces. In either case, nothing "has happened" to him. Moreover, the narrator's failure to recognize the wit Long might have had, casts doubts on his own intelligence--or on Newmarch's criteria for wit.

84. However, in her dealings with the narrator who talks like a tailor, Juliana also measures art by its economic value, "like an auctioneer" (*"AP"* 180.)

85. In his tale "Broken Wings," published shortly before *The Sacred Fount* (1900), Henry James also makes an explicit comparison between a country house and the theatre. Indeed, Mundham, the estate in question, is remarkably similar to Newmarch. There, too, "The visitor, at any rate, saw and felt it all through one of those fine hazes of August that remind you...of the artful gauze stretched across the stage of a theatre when an effect of mystery or some pantomimic

86. See Rimmon 183.


89. *OED* defines "rook" as applied to persons, "A cheat, swindler or sharper."

90. For a detailed discussion of this problem, see e.g. Krook 181-83.

91. *OED*.

92. Rimmon 220. In her chapter on *The Sacred Fount* 167-226, she demonstrates in great detail how that double movement works.


Notes to Chapter 4


5. Barbara DeMille, "Lambert Strether and the Tiger: Categories, Surfaces and Forms in Nietzsche and Henry James," *South Atlantic Review* 51 (1986): 73, 81. I discuss DeMille's article, as well as the possible relationship between Nietzsche and Henry James, in greater detail below, in ch. 5.
6. Yeazell 37. See also Dorothea Krook, who interprets The Beast in the Jungle as "a deliberately tragic version of The Ambassadors," in The Ordeal of Consciousness 333.

7. India, the origin of the cholera epidemic that reaches Venice in the narrative, was considered the homeland of Dionysus, and the tigers were the animals that pulled his chariot. See Vaget, Kommentar 171.

8. See e.g. Dierks, Studien zu Mythos und Psychologie 19, Kurzke, Thomas Mann 123-25, Renner, Lebenswerk 40.


10. Meyer 295. As a critic of poetry, Nietzsche praised Lessing, some of whose poems, he wrote, had "'the powerful, restless, forever playful power of a youthful tiger.'" Quoted in Meyer 664; emphasis added.


13. André von Gronicka, "Myth Plus Psychology: A Stylistic Analysis of Death in Venice," 1956; rpt. in H. Hatfield, ed., Thomas Mann: A Collection of Critical Essays (Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1967) 48. Heller also examines what he sees as Mann's achievement in combining absolute psychological realism with myth. See Der ironische Deutsche 105-10. Kurzke, in contrast, finds ambivalence in Mann's "double optic," and concludes that although Death in Venice is its author's "intellectual" attempt to "force together" myth and psychology, Aschenbach's fall reflects Mann's rejection of his own kind of art in which, fundamentally, he did not believe. See Kurzke 112-17. Manfred Dierks claims that Mann overcame the tension between myth (which deals with the type) and psychology (which analyzes the individual) first in the Joseph-tetralogy. In Death in Venice, there are mythological patterns, but no real confrontation with the myth itself, he argues. See Studien zu Mythos und Psychologie 229-230.


18. Mann himself, for instance, claimed on one occasion—but contradicted this claim on others—that he had written *Death in Venice* under the immediate influence of Freud. See Dierks, *Studien zu Mythos und Psychologie* 129.
21. See my discussion, above 66, 80.
22. See Goetz 174.
23. See e.g. Ulman 4.
24. See above, 92. The fatal "reading" of Milly Theale is discussed below, 173-174.
27. According to Rowe, May appears reliable, but, in fact, she manipulates Marcher in her aspiration for power. See *The Theoretical Dimensions of Henry James* 138.
30. Jane Tompkins's observation that the narrator gradually relinquishes his attitude as a disinterested observer, and that "the style of the closing paragraphs is charged with the force of pent-up feeling," could support such a reading. Re-living--as he re-tells it--the moment when the Beast overwhelms him, Marcher is unable to retain the "disinterested" tone that characterized his discourse at the beginning of the tale. See Jane P. Tompkins, "'The Beast in the Jungle': An Analysis of James's Late Style," *Modern Fiction Studies* 16 (1970): 188-89. Though allowing for a narrator who is not Marcher, Rachel Salmon is close to reading Marcher's voice as the narrative voice in *The Beast in the Jungle*, when she suggests that
"after the crisis," Marcher retells his tale from the point of view—that of the narrator and May Bartram—through which the reader has just read it. He then tells it again, she writes, in the "eternalized moment" of his hallucination, when he "becomes one" with "the two-faced Beast." It is that second reading, which Salmon calls "an act of sacred hermeneutics," that is creative. In my interpretation, however, both Marcher's and the reader's "hermeneutics" is "profane" in the sense that Marcher and the reader attempt the "naming for the purpose of mastering," and Marcher's voice could be the narrative voice. See Salmon 318, 307.

31. The term is Kohut's. See e.g. Bouson 14-15.
34. See Nance 438-39.
36. As a narcissist (who perceives himself as a creator), he rejects the "primal creativity" she "embodies." See Gargano 164.
37. DeMille 73.
38. See e.g. Goetz 178.
39. See e.g. Gargano 160.
40. Salmon 303.
41. Thomas Mann, Death in Venice, 1912, trans. H.T. Lowe-Porter, rpt. Thomas Mann, Death in Venice, Tristan, Tonio Kröger
42. The fact that we do not learn what John Marcher looks like could support my claim, that he is the narrator in *The Beast in the Jungle*. As for *Death in Venice*, Dorrit Cohn has written a detailed analysis of the narrator's shifting perspective, his increasing "estrangement" from Aschenbach, and its effect on the reader. See Dorrit Cohn, "The Second Author of *Der Tod in Venedig,*" 1983; rpt. in M. Ezergalis, ed., *Critical Essays on Thomas Mann* (Boston: Hall, 1988) 124-43. See also Eggenschwiler, "The Very Glance of Art" 59-85. Bouson's examines the narrator's role in the light of Kohut's theories about narcissism. See *The Emphatic Reader* 105-17. Herbert Lehnert rejects readings—specifically Cohn's--of the narrator as a separate "character." He speaks, rather, of a "narrative voice" that comes to the forefront whenever the text does not reproduce direct speech. To the extent that this voice is flexible, constantly presenting the protagonist from different perspectives, it can be judged "unreliable" by the reader, Lehnert maintains. See "Historischer Horizont und Fiktionalität in Thomas Manns *Der Tod in Venedig,*," in Heinz Gockel, Michael Neumann, Ruprecht Wimmer, eds., *Wagner--Nietzsche--Thomas Mann: Festschrift für Eckhard Heftrich* (Frankfurt: Klostermann, 1993) 275-76.

43. See Cohn 132.

44. See e.g. Heller, *Der ironische Deutsche* 109.

45. The fact that, unlike the reader, the narrator does not pick up these similarities, undercuts his reliability Cohn claims (137). The similarity between the strangers has attracted extensive critical attention, though critics differ in their accounts of the traits the characters have in common. Nor is there critical agreement as to which of the characters should be read as "similar strangers," or concerning their significance. von Gronicka's discussion is one of the most illuminating. See "Myth Plus Psychology" 46-61. See also Heller, *Der ironische Deutsche* 109-10. For different interpretations of the strangers, see e.g. Bouson 107-08, Dierks *Studien zu Mythos und Psychologie* 21-25, Kurzke 123, and Renner 47.

46. Börge Kristiansen, defines the *leitmotif* as Thomas Mann employs it, as an "identical textual basic element," whose repeated occurrences in *different* disguises and with *different* attributes makes the reader recognize relationships, which otherwise would be
concealed, and create meanings that are not intrinsic to the basic element itself. In *Death in Venice*, the strangers are different characters. However, bound together by their identical traits, they are also perceived by the reader as one "synchronic" character. See Börge Kristiansen, "Das Problem des Realismus bei Thomas Mann: Leitmotiv--Zitat--Mythische Wiederholungsstruktur," *Thomas-Mann-Handbuch* 829-31. Thomas Mann applied Wagner's development of the *leitmotif* as a structural device already in his early stories, in *Buddenbrooks*, *Tonio Kröger* and in *Tristan*. See e.g. Reed, Thomas Mann: *The Uses of Tradition* 75, Hans Gehrke and Martin Thunich, *Thomas Mann: Der kleine Herr Friedemann* 29, Karl Ernst Laage, "Thomas Manns Verhältnis zu Theodor Storm" 16, and Kurzke 98. For different aspects of the function of the *leitmotif* in *Death in Venice*, see e.g. Heller, *Der ironische Deutsche* 87-89, Gronicka 56, Kurzke 121-23. I discuss Mann's use of *leitmotif* in *Doctor Faustus* in detail below, in ch. 6.

47. Kristiansen 831. Cohn points out that the strangers are given their meaning by their serial appearances rather than from each individual appearance (136).

48. *Langenscheidts Grosswörterbuch*.

49. See e.g. Phillips 379.

50. Koopmann reads the barber, too, as one of the strangers who lead Aschenbach to his death. See Konstanten 72.

51. Vaget, *Thomas Mann Kommentar* 175.

52. Dierks reads all the strangers as "Thanatos" as well as Dionysus. See Studien zu Mythos und Psychologie 25. Heller recognizes Dürer's image of death in the stranger at the cemetery. See *Der ironische Deutsche* 110.

53. See Renner 70.

54. See Phillips 383, and Cohn 131.


Renner 64. I differ here from critics who read the tiger as a "Dionysian" symbol only, e.g. Dierks 19, Kurzke 125.

Phillips 379.

See Freud, "Leonardo da Vinci" 191. If John Marcher too is read as a homosexual, this could establish a further link between the Beasts, and thus between the two nouvellas.

See Renner 46. Here Aschenbach resembles the artist-characters in Mann's early works, which were discussed above, in ch. 1.

Hayes and Quinby 163.

Mann commented on several occasions that everything that "happened" to Aschenbach had happened to him during a journey to Brioni and Venice in 1911--the stranger in Munich, the cholera epidemic in Venice, some kind of an "experience" with a Polish boy, and so on. See Vaget, *Kommentar* 176-77.


See e.g. Vaget, *Thomas Mann Kommentar* 176-77, 180-81, and Dierks *Studien zur Mythos und Psychologie* 14. See also Werner Frizen, "Fausts Tod in Venedig," in *Wagner—Nietzsche—Thomas Mann* 245-78. Frizen examines similarities in character, structure, theme, metaphors and even narrative technique between Goethe's *Faust* and its "clandestine competitor" *Death in Venice* (229). Heller speaks about a "mythological shortcut" that involves Nietzsche as well as Goethe, for, he writes, *Wahlverwandschaften* tells about the conflict between Apollo and Dionysus, and Nietzsche, who like Goethe, was one of the young Mann's educators made the tension between the two mythological figures central to his theories about art. Rilke develops further the tension between garden and jungle, which in Freud become the conscious and the unconscious. See Erich Heller, *The Poet's Self and the Poem: Essays on Goethe, Nietzsche, Rilke and Thomas Mann* (London: Athlone, 1976) 85.

See e.g. Heller, *The Poet's Self* 81-82. Nietzsche wrote several works in Venice, but his madness broke out in Turin--
"unreported unlike Wagner's death in Venice." Gunter E. Grimm et al. "Ein Gefühl von freiem Leben": Deutsche Dichter in Italien (Stuttgart: J.B. Metzler, 1990) 206. For other "influences" on Mann that are reflected in Death in Venice, for instance Platen's and Mahlers, see e.g. Vaget 175-81 and Heller, The Poet's Self 78-80 and Der ironische Deutsche 113.

66. One of Nietzsche's "accusations" of Wagner was the claim that the composer constructed "artifacts" out of "fragments," rather than works of art out of the "whole" experience of life. See e.g. Kurzke 88.

67. See Bouson 4-5, 107.

68. Langenscheidts Grosswörterbuch.

69. See Renner 40.

70. Marcher's interpretation is self-deceptive, if he is read as the narrator of his own text.

71. Bouson, 25, 109. Both Cohn, "The Second Author" (136) and Eggenschwiller, "The Very Glance of Art" (72) make similar claims.


74. Bouson 105-06.

75. Heller speaks of Mann's deliberately achieved "incongruity between the message delivered and the tone of voice in which it is delivered." See The Poet's Self 86. Peter Greiser has examined the hexameters concealed in Mann's prose. He concludes that in Death in Venice hexameters occur so often that they must be seen as a stylistic device. Peter Greiser, "'En hexametro tono': In hexametrischem Versmass," Blätter der Thomas Mann Gesellschaft Zürich 22 (1987-88): 22.

Notes to Chapter 5


4. Trilling 169.
5. See above, 130-1.
9. Another significant link between the two works is the study of each of sociopolitical and economic processes, a study which has received critical attention. The "international theme" that Dorothea Krook discusses in her reading of *The Wings of the Dove*, clearly has social and economic aspects. See e.g. Krook, *The Ordeal of Consciousness*, 198, 203-204. Millicent Bell interprets James's novel in the context of social and economic processes in the early 20th century (291-92). Among recent critics of Thomas Mann, Uwe Ebel, in particular, places *Buddenbrooks* firmly within a sociopolitical framework, to a great extent reading the Buddenbrook family as a social and political construct, destroyed in the conflict between ancient patriarchal rules of inheritance and the laws of a modern economy. See *Die Kunst als Welt der Freiheit: Studien zur Werkstruktur und Werkabsicht bei Thomas Mann*, Wissenschaftliche Reihe 4 (Metelen/Steinfurt: DEV, 1991) 46-47.
11. "With Thomas and Gerda the contradiction between burgher and artist is brought into the family. For Hanno it directly determines the opposition between the worlds of the father and the mother, as well as an opposition between reality and day-dreaming wishful thinking" (Renner 61).
12. Renner 62.
13. That is, Renner claims, partly because she communicates to Hanno Schopenhauer's theory concerning the insignificance of individuality. According to Renner, Hanno's musical experience will ultimately represent a recognition of, and a liberation from, the finite world, a liberation theoretically traced by Schopenhauer. See Renner 62-63.
14. See Kurzke 76.
17. Kurzke points out that for old Johann Buddenbrook, Hanno's great-grandfather, the music of his time was "convivial entertainment," as opposed to the "solitary ecstasy" Hanno experiences when he plays Wagner (73). See also Renner 63.
18. See e.g. Kesting 34-35; and Heller, Der ironische Deutsche 56-57.
19. According to Renner, the music represents Hanno's emotionally consummated union with his mother, which neither Pfühl ("the good father"), nor Thomas ("the bad father") has the power to oppose. The boy’s drive towards this union is acknowledged both by the narrator and by Hanno's own consciousness, just before his death, and even then it is "censored" by the narrator's apparently clinical description of death by typhoid. See Renner 64.
21. Quoted from Susan Sontag, Illness as Metaphor (1978; rpt. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1983) 47-48. Heller emphasizes that Hanno's death stands in contrast to Schopenhauer's condemnation of "voluptuous suicide." Heller, Der ironische Deutsche 57-58. Kesting maintains that according to Mann's reading of Schopenhauer under the influence of Nietzsche, music demands sacrifices, and that Hanno's death is such a sacrifice (35-36). Grawe points out that Mann's apparently insignificant verbal changes from his "source" add to his text the psychological aspect of disease that the encyclopedia entry ignores and thus pave the way for the reader's recognition of Hanno's won "responsibility" (123).
22. Kurzke 58.
24. Vaget, Kommentar 68.
25. See e.g. Renner 65; Reed Thomas Mann 59.
27. Heller, Der ironische Deutsche 35.
28. For instance, when, to his father's delight, he apes "Aunt Antonie or Uncle Christian" and teases poor Clothilde (Buddenbrooks 484-85).

29. See Wysling, Narzissmus 123.


31. See Koopmann, Konstanten 19.

32. See above 80.


34. Dierks, "Psychische Konstitution und 'Sprachwerk' bei Thomas Mann" 275.


36. Wysling, Narzissmus 68.

37. Wysling, Narzissmus 71-72.

38. See Meyer 42-44, 474-75.

39. Renner 65-66. In contrast to Renner, both Wysling and Dierks read Buddenbrooks as predominantly reflecting Thomas Mann's reading of Schopenhauer. So does Heller, on the whole, despite his finding traces of Nietzsche in Thomas's revelation, partly because Nietzsche always remained bound by Schopenhauer, he claims. Reed, goes further and claims that it was Nietzsche rather than Schopenhauer who influenced Buddenbrooks, and that Thomas Buddenbrook represents the complexity of Mann's transition from the influence of Schopenhauer to that of Nietzsche. See Wysling, Narzissmus 69; Dierks, "Über einige Beziehungen" 273-76; Heller, Der ironische Deutsche 40-42, 49-51; Reed 48-49.

40. "The sea is the landscape of lost consciousness and of spacelessness and timelessness in Thomas Mann's metaphysics," Kurzke maintains. It corresponds to Schopenhauer's "'constant eternity'" (Kurzke 77).

41. Hanno,

saw not only the unerring charm which his father exercised upon everybody: he saw as well, with strange and anguished penetration, how cruelly hard it was upon him. He saw how his father, paler and more silent after each visit, would lean back in his corner of the carriage with closed eyes and reddened eyelids; he realized with a sort of horror that on the threshold of the next house a mask would glide over
his face, a galvanized activity would take hold of the weary frame (*Buddenbrooks* 484).

42. Bourget also "influenced" Thomas Mann, and the effect of that "influence" on the writer's early works is frequently commented upon; for example, Vaget states that "Thomas Mann accepted Bourget's and Nietzsche's insistence that decadence must be overcome. Vaget, "Die Erzählungen" 540.


44. Donadio 177, 152.

45. Donadio 154.

46. To my knowledge, that aspect of the links between Nietzsche and Henry James has not been explored.

47. Henry James, "The Middle Years," 1893; rpt. in Henry James, *The Figure in the Carpet and Other Stories*, ed., Frank Kermode (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1986) 243, 245. Further references will be to this edition.

48. James, "The Middle Years" 257-58.

49. See e.g. Sontag 39.

50. Perhaps because "contact with someone afflicted with a disease regarded as a mysterious malevolency inevitably feels as trespass; worse, like the violation of a taboo" (Sontag 10).


53. This claim is only partly contradicted by Henry James's presentation, in the Preface, of the "idea" of *The Wings of the Dove*: that "of a young person conscious of a great capacity for life, but early stricken and doomed, condemned to die under short respite, while also enamoured of the world," for in addition to granting her the "capacity for life," James says that the "young woman... herself...[is] the opposition--to the catastrophe announced by the associated Fates," and is ready to "struggle" for "as much of the fruit of life as possible" (*The Art of the Novel* 288, 289, 290, 291).

54. See above, 74-75.

55. Donadio 61, 183.


57. DeMille, pp. 77, 81.
58. She descends, David McWirter claims, to create meaning and reality. See *Desire and Love in Henry James: A Study of the Late Novels* (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1989) 116.

59. In the context of this chapter, where I discuss the significance of Wagner for the interpretation of art as a metaphor for disease, it is tempting to dwell on Susan's reference to the beginning of the journey as "a Wagner overture" (*WD* 91) and adopt Oscar Cargill's assumption that the overture is to *Tristan and Isolde*, which Henry James, like Shaw, might have considered "'a poem of destruction and death.'" Though an elaboration of this assumption might strengthen my claim that Milly is attracted by the "bliss" of death, I find Cargill's argument that Wagner's music is a "catalyzer" for *The Wings of the Dove* a tenuous premise for his subsequent reading of the novel as inspired by the Tristan story. See *The Novels of Henry James* 338-39. Susan's reference to Wagner is of the same kind as her reading of Milly in the light of "Maeterlinck and Pater...Marbot and Gregorovius" (*WD* 80), that is, it throws light on Susan rather than on Milly.

60. For slightly different readings of this passage, see, e.g. Stowe, *Balzac, James, and the Realistic Novel* 141-42, and McWhirter 112. Both critics agree that Milly's decision to go to London is influenced by her love for Densher, but they consider England her choice of one of the kingdoms of the earth.


62. Rowe's argument differs from mine in its claim that Kate's "loss of relatives" and her "intention" to save the "family phrase from the silence and meaninglessness that threaten it," contrasts Milly's "desire simply 'to live' and 'to keep everything' in her love for the very taste of life." See Rowe, *Henry Adams and Henry James* 182-83.

63. According to Nietzsche, art is such an affirmation of life. See Meyer 284-85.

64. See e.g. Meyer 282-83, and DeMille 80.

65. Though McWhirter appears to absolve Densher, "a helpless captive of his own desire," from responsibility for his "forcing Kate to come to him in his rooms," his reading of this passage is similar to mine:

...the resulting consummation is less an act of love than a desperate attempt to create a token or a symbol of a relationship that has already been drained of its reality...Rather, what Densher has
purchased, and at great cost...is a hollow image of a desire that is now...wholly divorced from any possibility of concrete satisfaction...Densher begins to infuse his abode with the hermetic, timeless, venerative atmosphere of a museum dedicated to the memory of something that is, like the Bronzino portrait Milly views at Matcham, "dead, dead, dead" (McWhirter 130).

66. See above, 100.


68. Cameron 132.

69. The fact that Susan uses different metaphors for Milly does not change matters. Rather than being creative interpretations, they are also "categories." Taken from literature (e.g. "heiress of all the ages," WD 79, from Tennyson), or the newspapers (e.g. her seeing Milly in "the term always used in the newspapers about the great new steamers who drew an inordinate number of 'feet of water,'" WD 81), they testify to Susan's inability to deal with "real" experience and her consequent need for representations found in texts written by others. For the reference to Tennyson, see Goode, "The Pervasive Mystery of Style" 258-59.

70. Goode 257, 256.

71. These terms are from Walter Kaufmann's translation of Nietzsche's *Beyond Good and Evil*, quoted in Donadio 115. For Donadio's application of these concepts to James's "lucid reflector," see 132-33.


73. Nevertheless, as critics point out, the Mannerist portrait is particularly well suited to evoke sadness and impress on Milly the awareness of her own death. Rowe, for example, notes that the absence of joy recognized by Milly is "reflected in the late
Renaissance mannerist style" (Henry Adams and Henry James 186). And Hopkins elaborates:

Typically Mannerist, Bronzino's figures are elongated and distorted: his people appear both over-graceful and ascetic, wordly and spiritual, elegant and sad...Coming after the Watteau image, which conjures up a delicate imaginary world exempt from time and pain, good and evil, the Bronzino becomes a symbol of mortality; the elegance and splendor incompletely mask an all-pervading sadness and sense of mutability (Hopkins 104).

Cameron, on the other hand, claims that Milly looks not at the lady in the painting, "but at the original of that lady...extrapolated, projected forward, and conceptually located between her youth and her fading." Milly "sees the woman as she sees herself, another woman who is dying" (Cameron 128).

74. See e.g. Rowe who argues that "art is viewed by most of [the characters] as something to be possessed--a glittering, jeweled object-rather than an activity and process" (Henry Adams and Henry James 185).

75. See Kurzke 77.

76. Cameron points to another, "chiastic," relation between the scene in Sir Luke's waiting room and that at Matcham when Milly looks at the Bronzino. In the latter, "she reads the picture as a gloss of her own death." In the former, "Milly glosses her death as if it were a picture" (141).

77. See e.g. Graham, The Drama of Fulfilment 194.

78. See OED. Cameron also refers to this death sentence, but her reading differs from mine: "...pity ought to be the response to the head on the pike, as opposed to being the head on the pike. Understanding the unconventionality of the image means seeing that Milly interprets pity not only as the death sentence but also as the emblem of death" (138).

79. OED

80. "For Kate, the image of the dove seems to suggest Milly's helpless passivity, her mild willingness to be sacrificed...For Milly, on the other hand, the image of the dove suggests a mask, and a model for effective action" (Stowe 152).

81. See e.g. Stowe 165.

82. "'She's, you know, my princess,'" Susan tells Densher (WD 298). "She was the American girl as he had originally found
her," Densher concludes (WD 302). "'She's a dove,'" Kate states (WD 304). And Kate also indicates that Sir Luke is watching Milly's performance closely: "'She's doing it for him'--and she nodded in the direction of Milly's medical visitor. 'She wants to be for him at her best. But she can't deceive him.'" (WD 305)

83. McWhirter claims that, unlike the reader, Densher fails in "figuratively filling out" the absence represented by the lost letter (139-40).

84. Renner develops this line of argument (58-60).

85. Kurzke maintains that the decline affecting the successive generations of Buddenbrooks stems from their developing tendency to reflection. He does not, however, present a convincing cause for that tendency (70). Wysling argues that the novel reflects its author's preoccupation with biological and psychological causes for decline rather than with political and economic ones. He does not suggest that Mann finds answers to the questions he raises in *Buddenbrooks* (Narzissmus 196).

86. See e.g. Meyer 259; Heller, *Der ironische Deutsche* 81.

87. See "decadent," "decay" in *OED*.

88. See Rowe, *Henry Adams and Henry James*: "The reader's voyage is a quest, an active engagement of the language of the work and a creative transposition of that language into the forms for his own understanding" (173).

Notes to Chapter 6


2. Bakhtin, *Dostoevsky's Poetics* 284.


4. Bakhtin, *Dostoevsky's Poetics* 6, 16. I have outlined some of Bakhtin's theories referred to here above. See my introduction and 43-44.


8. See e.g. Lodge, "After Bakhtin" 99. Lodge's claim that we can "[infer] the existence of a creative mind that produces [the novel] by a kind of literary ventriloquism," suggests that the different voices that the reader discerns in the text are actually all those of the author. The author is, in Lodge's term, much more powerful than we might suppose.

9. See Bakhtin, *Dostoevsky's Poetics* 32. Reading *The Golden Bowl* in the light of phenomenological philosophy, in general, and the concepts of Merleau-Ponty, in particular, Merle A. Williams reaches a similar conclusion. The text, she maintains, is made up of the meanings created by the characters, the reader and the author, so that its meaning is constantly restructured, and its only "truth" lies in the "overall process of the novel which interweaves [their] activities." *Henry James and the Philosophical Novel: Being and Seeing* (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1993) 218-20.


11. It is Fanny Assingham who accurately predicts that Maggie, who, she is convinced, is the personification of "Good," will be exposed "to the discovery of [evil], to the knowledge of it, to the crude experience of it...To the harsh bewildering brush, the daily chilling breath of it." Henry James, *The Golden Bowl* (1904; rev. 1909; rpt. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1987) 310. Further references will be in the text and to this edition.

12. Thomas Mann, *Doctor Faustus: The Life of the German Composer Adrian Leverkühn as Told by a Friend*, trans. H.T. Lowe-Porter (1947; rpt. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1971) 490. Further references will be in the text and to this edition. References to the German original, also in the text, will be to the following edition: Frankfurt: Fischer, 1960. Whereas in *Doctor Faustus*, both damnation and redemption are explicitly discussed by the characters, the "redemptive theme" is implicit in *The Golden Bowl*, and it has, indeed, been differently interpreted by readers. For a survey of critics who either see Maggie as "the personification of Divine Grace," or, in contrast, "a creature of evil," see Walter Wright, "Maggie Verver: Neither Saint nor Witch" (1957), rpt. in Tony Tanner, ed., *Henry James: Modern Judgements* (London: Macmillan, 1968) 317-18; 325-26. For a more recent account for the contrasting interpretations of *The Golden Bowl*, see e.g. Ruth Yeazell, *Language and Knowledge in the Late Novels of Henry James* 131-32.

20. Although he appears to appeal to Fanny to complete the "'pair'" and be the "'lead'" he can "'perfectly follow,'" the word "consort," while denoting "a ship sailing in company with another," also means "spouse" (*OED*). 
21. See e.g. Holland 366, and David McWhirter, *Desire and Love in Henry James* 189.
25. The scene resembles, to some extent, the one in *The Portrait of a Lady,* when Isabel is moved by Madame Merle's playing the piano at Gardencourt. The resemblance between Charlotte and Madame Merle has been noted, for example, in Leo Bersani, *The

26. That it does not last is suggested by Charlotte's expressed regret that she and Adam have no child, and that she now is "too sure [that it] will never be" (GB 256).

27. See Matthiessen 88.


33. Boone 380. For Adam's relationship with Maggie, see e.g. Philip Sicker, Love and the Quest for Identity in the Fiction of Henry James 159-60. While commending critics for being justifiably cautious in applying Freudian structures to the novel, McWhirter nevertheless analyzes Maggie's "failure to move beyond the Oedipal crisis" and concludes that she lives in "an imaginary world" in "entire disregard of reality-testing'" and "under the dominance of the ancient pleasure principle'" (189-90). His quotation is from Freud's "The Two Principles of Mental Functioning." Matthiessen, in contrast, argues that "James regards [the] intimacy between father and daughter as 'perfectly natural'...and naively innocent" (92-93), and Wilson claims that as Maggie is "childlike" rather than "childish"; her adoration of her father is "never even remotely pathological" (192). In contrast, Lydia Zwinger traces the "unspeakable" relationship (83) between Adam and Maggie ("unspeakable" also because it is never "spoken" in the text [95]) to a perverse sentimentalization of the father-daughter relationship reflected in novels by Dickens and Alcott, for instance. She reads Maggie--"a modern sister of Oedipus" (95) in her self-imposed final blindness--as constrained within a narrative mastered by her father. See Daughters, Fathers and the Novel: The Sentimental Romance of Heterosexuality (Madison: Univ. of Wisconsin Press, 1991) 76-95. While not treating The Golden Bowl explicitly, Alfred Habegger reads the sentimentalization of the father-daughter relationship in 19th century American fiction and in later works by Henry James himself as reflecting an "incestuous yearning." Henry James and the "Woman Business" (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1989) 26.

34. Henry James "Preface to The Portrait of a Lady," The Art of the Novel 46. The similarity between Maggie's pagoda and Henry
James's house of fiction has been commented upon by a number of critics. See e.g. Holland 336; Pearson 343; and Mark L. Krupnick, "The Golden Bowl: Henry James's Novel about Nothing," English Studies 57 (1976): 534.

35. James, The Art of the Novel 46.
36. Boone 381.
37. Cameron 110.
38. Boone 381.
39. Cameron 110.


42. "She stepped into his prison" and "recognized the virtual identity of his condition with that aspect of Charlotte's situation for which...she had found, with so little seeking, the similitude of the locked cage" (GB 526).

43. Barbara DeMille, "Lambert Strether and the Tiger" 73. See above, 114, 156.

44. Donadio, Nietzsche, Henry James and the Artistic Will 183.

45. James, The Art of the Novel 46.

46. Krook, The Ordeal of Consciousness 323. A number of more recent critics also discuss the implications of the open-endedness of The Golden Bowl. For example, Mark Seltzer claims that it leads to the constant reenactment of an exercise of power that, however, also disowns power in a rectifying and normalizing procedure (95). Martha Nussbaum argues that the open-endedness indicates that Maggie's moral ideal is imperfect like everything human, but, nonetheless, "precious." See her article "Flawed Crystals: James's The Golden Bowl and Literature as Moral Philosophy," New Literary History 15 (1983): 38. Marianna Torgovnick, in contrast, reads the end as a painful compromise that points to Maggie's moral weakness. Closure in the Novel (Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 1981) 155-56. Sicker sees darkness and death at the end of the novel (167-68). Boone, finally, reads the ambiguity of the end as the "tangible product of a desire to evolve a mode of representation capable of expressing an ambivalent vision of married life beyond the 'happy end' of traditional fiction" (374).

50. Miller 113-14.
52. Wilson 281-82, 194.
53. Cross, 189-90; emphasis added.
54. In his Norton Lectures, Leonard Bernstein demonstrates in detail how the unity of a piece of music is achieved by the repetition and constant transformations of musical motives. See for example his discussion of Beethoven's *Pastorale Symphony* in *The Unanswered Question: Six Talks at Harvard* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard Univ Press, 1976) 157-84.
55. "Or ever the silver cord be loosed, or the golden bowl broken, or the pitcher be broken at the fountain, or the wheel broken at the cistern. Then shall the dust return to the earth as it was: and the spirit shall return to God who gave it" (Eccles. 12, 6-7).
56. Kenneth Graham, *Indirections of the Novel: James, Contrad, and Forster* (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1988) 81. One of Graham's examples is Adam's apparently harmless "'long fine cord,'" which becomes ominous by the "pointed allusion" to the "'silken noose,'" "'silken halter,'" "'twisted silken rope,'" "'unnatural tether,'" "'long cord,'" "'gathered lasso,'" and, finally, Adam's "'hooked thumb.'" The shifting meanings of the golden bowl have received extensive critical attention. See, for example, Holland 344-49; Matthiessen 83-87; Rose 105-106; Cameron 113-17; Sicker 165-66.
57. Actually, Adrian's "discovery" is not at all original. Bernstein, for instance, demonstrates how, already in works by Mozart, Beethoven, Berlioz, Wagner and Debussy, among others, the ear cannot determine, when hearing a chord, in what key that chord is. See *The Unanswered Question* 193-259. For the applicability of Bernstein's discussion of musical ambiguity to *Doctor Faustus*, see John F. Fetzer, *Music, Love, Death and Mann's Doctor Faustus* 2.
60. Helmut Koopmann, "Doktor Faustus," Thomas-Mann-Handbuch 487, 486. (Unlike the English translation, the German original begins with this sentence.)

61. Fetzer makes a similar observation but claims that in the first chapter Zeitblom commits a much more glaring "narrative blunder" than he chides himself for "by outlining the prime...components of Adrian's entire career" (23).

62. For a discussion of the reader's role in Doctor Faustus, see e.g. Herbert Lehnert, "Nachwort: Doktor Faustus, ein moderner Roman mit offenem historischen Horizont," Thomas Mann Jahrbuch (1989) 163-77.

63. Mann, Die Entstehung des Doktor Faustus 132.


65. Bloom, The Anxiety of Influence 53-54. Among German critics, Vaget explicitly applies to Doctor Faustus Bloom's 'typology...according to which authors determine their relations to literary tradition and attempt to make them productive.' See Vaget, "Thomas Mann und James Joyce" 127-28.

66. Fetzer 36.

67. See Ulla Hofstaetter, "Dämonische Dichter": Die literarischen Vorlagen für Adrian Leverkühns Kompositionen im Roman Doktor Faustus," in Hans Wölflkirchen, ed., "Die Bedeutung, die auf mich fällt, hat...oft gewechselt": Neue Studien zum Werk Thomas Manns (Würzburg: Königshausen und Neumann, 1991) 148. The article accounts for these texts in detail (146-188). See also Fetzer 98.


69. Hofstaetter 163.

70. In addition to the opera Love's Labour Lost and several of Shakespeare's sonnets, which Leverkühn sets to music, he quotes


73. According to Gunilla Bergsten, who examines Mann's "montage-technique," as well as the sources for his innumerable "quotations," Mann himself did not make a clear distinction between "montage" and "quotation." See her study *Thomas Mann's Doctor Faustus: The Sources and Structure of the Novel*, 1963; trans. Krishna Winston (Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1969) 15. A more recent study, based on material that was inaccessible to Bergsten, is that of Lieselotte Voss, *Die Entstehung von Thomas Manns Roman "Doktor Faustus,"* Studien zur deutschen Literatur 39 (Tübingen: Niemeyer, 1975).


75. "Not love [he exclaims]...Poor Devil! Do you want to justify your famed stupidity...and base your bargain on so flexible, so insidious a concept as--love? What I have contracted, the reason for my alleged compact with you, what is its source, pray, if not love, even if it is poisoned by you with God's sanction? Is not the very bond you claim we have entered connected with love, you fool? You insinuate that I wanted it and went into the forest, to the quadruple cross-road for the sake of the work. But is not the work itself said to be connected with love?" (*Faustus*, German text 267).

76. Actually, Zeitblom connects eroticism and music already in the episode where Hanne, the full-bosomed stable-girl, sings "lustily" and introduces the boys to the "round" and its polyphony (*Faustus* 31-32). For the links between music and sexuality in these two episodes, see e.g. Fetzer, particularly pp. 25-26; 44-48, and Brigitte Prutti, "Frauengestalten in *Doktor Faustus*," *Thomas Mann Jahrbuch* (1989), 70-71.

77. For the influence of Kierkegaard on *Doctor Faustus*, see e.g. Vaget, "Thomas Mann und James Joyce" 133-34, 141; Aronson 111, 122-23; Koopmann, "*Doktor Faustus*" 492; Fetzer 25-26, 28-29.
78. I rely here on the commonly accepted hypothesis that Esmeralda and Frau von Tolna are identical. For a survey of critics who have developed the hypothesis, see Fetzer 44. Fetzer himself develops "the Tolna Esmeralda connection" in detail (64-71). See also Vaget, "Thomas Mann und James Joyce" 144-147.
79. Prutti 78.
80. Prutti 63-69.
82. Renner 355-56, Aronson 122-23.
84. Thomas Mann, "Deutschland und die Deutschen," 1945; rpt. in Thomas Mann, *Politische Schriften und Reden* 3 (Frankfurt: Fischer, 1968) 165.
85. Aronson 187.
88. That, most probably, the stranger at the graveside is Frau von Tolna, the "positive" double of Esmeralda Hetaera, remains the reader's conjecture. See Fetzer 64-71.
89. Debating the modernism of *Doctor Faustus*, recent German critics differ in their assessments of the closure of the novel. Whereas, for example, Hans Vaget claims that Thomas Mann's fictive narrator-biographer composes a traditionally closed text, Herbert Lehnert considers this text open, in particular, because its social and historical framework requires that the reader add his perspective to the narrator's restricted perception. See Hans Rudolf Vaget, "Thomas Mann und James Joyce" 149; and Herbert Lehnert, "Nachwort: Doktor Faustus" 163. The more history we, the readers, know, the more fully we can read what Mann himself was restricted (by time) in observing.
90. See B. Kristiansen, "Das Problem des Realismus bei Thomas Mann" 831.
92. Aronson 196.
93. This is a point Thomas Mann himself makes in *Die Entstehung des Doktor Faustus* 105-06.
94. Mann, *Die Entstehung des Doktor Faustus* 103.

96. Mann, Die Entstehung des Doktor Faustus 103.

97. Gunilla Bergsten "pick[s] out three time levels that exist independently but mutually influence each other. The 'objective' time level, Adrian's life, contains the sum of all previous German history or is a symbol of it; at the same time it anticipates the events taking place while Zeitblom tells his story." She also refers to other critics who "divide" the three time levels differently. Bergsten's reading differs from mine, because she interprets Adrian, rather than Zeitblom's text as a whole, as a chord "sum[ming] up an entire process of historical evolution as a chord sums up a series of notes." See Bergsten 135-36. Lieselotte Voss distinguishes between the time of the Reformation, the time of the "action," which she divides into the years of World War I and those of the Weimar Republic, and the time during which Zeitblom writes. She presents tables constructed by Mann, in which, he lists the fictional and authentic occurrences year by year. See 128-76.


99. See e.g. Kurzke 279.

100. This is because in Germany in particular (as Mann himself points out), the Faust-figure, especially Goethe's Faust, is widely considered to be the representative of the German spirit. Mann himself finds the Faust of the Chapbook more representative than the hero of Goethe's drama, but in any case, he writes, the ideal German Faust-figure should be "demonically" musical. See Thomas Mann, "Deutschland und die Deutschen" 165. For a discussion of Germany, Faust and Thomas Mann, see Barbro Eberan, Luther? Friedrich "der Große"? Wagner? Nietzsche?...?...? Wer war an Hitler Schuld? Die Debatte um die Schuldfrage 1945-49 (2nd rev. ed., Munich: Minerva, 1985) 91. As for the problem of creativity, Fisch points out that the Faust theme is closely related to the artist theme. See A Remembered Future 24.

101. Quoted from Fisch 20.

102. That Leverkühn's biography contains many elements from that of Nietzsche, especially the brothel-episode, the syphilitic
infection, and the collapse into madness, is commonly recognized. For a detailed account of these parallels, see Bergsten 55-64. See also Kurzke 273. As for Strauss, Leverkühn's journey to Pressburg took place in conjunction with his attending the Austrian première of Salome (Faustus 150). See e.g. Fetzer 48.


104. Fisch 25.

105. Lacan, "The Mirror Stage" 735; see my detailed discussion above 78-85.

106. For a discussion of the Faust figure as "doppelgänger," see Fisch 38-39.


108. The result resembles "a Janus-head, looking back critically and forward with dejection." (Hage, "'Doktor Faustus' ein moderner Roman?" 121).

109. While critics agree that the structure of the text is polyphonic and thus resembles music, they point out that Leverkühn's twelve-tone system, and, consequently, his break with musical conventions, cannot be adequately reproduced in language. See e.g. Windisch-Laube 334. Vaget goes even further with his claim that the text is organized according to the late-romantic epic model of Wagner. See "Thomas Mann und James Joyce" 136.


111. Aronson 69-70.

112. Renner 311.

113. Mann, Die Entstehung des Doktor Faustus 108. Bergsten accounts for critical attempts to trace the prototypes for Leverkühn's
works. She claims that Mann either "described" or interpreted real compositions, or consulted musicologists (87).

114. Theoretically, it is possible to verbalize a musical score--by defining key, pitch, rhythm, instrumentation etc.--but this is not what Zeitblom attempts to do.

116. Fetzer 106.

117. In the chapter "The Unanswered Question," Fetzer gives examples of several interpretations of the letter "g," which, he demonstrates, is made "liberal use of" at the end of the text. While Fetzer dwells on the "g" in "God" ("Gott") and words like "Grace" and "good" ("Gnade," "gut"), he admits that a reading of the letter as standing for these words would suggest a "one-dimensional [interpretation] of Mann's multidimensional novel." See Fetzer 73-126.

118. For different readings of the question of redemption or damnation in Doctor Faustus, as well as the influences on the text by the Chapbook and Goethe's Faust, respectively, see e.g. Helmut Koopmann, "Doktor Faustus--eine Geschichte der deutschen Innerlichkeit?" Thomas Mann Jahrbuch (1989), 10-11, Koopmann, "'Doktor Faustus' als Widerlegung der Weimarer Klassik" 104-105, Vaget, "Thomas Mann und James Joyce" 140-41, and Fetzer 120-121.

121. See Bergsten 197, 205, and Voss, who makes this observation and examines its implications (212-13).
122. See Renner 325.
123. Renner 364.
124. Aronson 204-5.
125. Koopmann, "Doktor Faustus" 16-17.
126. See Lehnert 172.
127. See Aronson 205.
128. Mann, Die Entstehung des Doktor Faustus 142.
129. Mann informed the listeners to his radio talks beamed at Germany of the extermination of Jews as early as 1942. See Judith Ryan, The Uncompleted Past: Postwar German Novels and the Third Reich (Detroit: Wayne State Univ. Press, 1983) 145.
130. See Mann, Die Entstehung des Doktor Faustus 145, and "Die Lager," first printed as "Thomas Mann on the Question of

131. Mann, "Die Lager" 160.

132. See e.g. Vaget, "Germany: Jekyll and Hyde" 260, Eberan 90-91, Kurzke 280. Thomas Mann discusses the beginning of his conflict with the "inner emigrants" in Die Entstehung des Doktor Faustus (158).
Works by Henry James:


Works by Thomas Mann:


----- "Die Lager." First printed as "Thomas Mann on the Question of German Guilt." Bayerische Landeszeitung: Nachrichtenblatt


Other works:


Bahr, Edward. "'Identität des Nichtidentischen': Zur Dialektik der Kunst in Thomas Manns Doktor Faustus im Lichte von


Dierks, Manfred. Studien zu Mythos und Psychologie bei Thomas Mann: Aus seinem Nachlass orientierte Untersuchungen zum
Bibliography


